# NAGOYA UNIVERSITY Graduate School of Law

# **Doctoral Dissertation**

# Development of Administrative Litigation in Mongolia: From Administrative Control to Court Remedy?

The LL.D. (Comparative Law) Program in Law and Political Science (2014-2017)
Student Name: Tsogt Tsend
Student ID Number: 431404082

Academic Advisor : Professor ICHIHASHI Katsuya Academic Sub-Advisor : Professor SHIMOYAMA Kenji Academic Sub-Advisor : Professor INABA Kazumasa

Date of Submission: June 26, 2017

#### **Table of Contents**

# Acknowledgements

#### **Abstract**

#### Introduction

# Chapter I: History of Settlement of Administrative Disputes in Mongolia 1921-1990

- 1.1. Introduction
- 1.2. Background of the Problem
- 1.3. After Revolutionary Period (prior to 1960)
  - 1.3.1. Historical background for judicial development
  - 1.3.2. 1924 Constitution
  - 1.3.3. Establishment of the court
  - 1.3.4. Procedural law
  - 1.3.5. Administrative Dispute
  - 1.3.6. Creation of General Supervision
- 1.4. Socialist Period (1960 until 1990)
  - 1.4.1. Further Advancement of the General Supervision of the Procuracy

**Procuracy as Complaint Handler** 

1.4.2. Administrative Cases Enumerated in The Civil Investigative Law as complaint procedure

Theory: Establishment of administrative law as branch law

Administrative Disputes Enumerated in the Civil Investigative Law

- 1.5. Post Socialist Period (from 1990 until 2002/2004)
  - 1.5.1 Initiative toward Separate Administrative Litigation

1990 Special Law on Complaint Procedure

After Collapse of Socialist Regime: 1992 Constitution

- 1.6. Summary
- 1.7. Conclusion

# Chapter II: Comparative Historical Analysis from the view point of "Control type and Remedy type" of administrative litigation: France, Germany and Japan.

- 2.1. Introduction
- 2.2. French: Categorization of administrative litigation
  - 2.2.1. Introduction: Importance of relevance of French law in this research
  - 2.2.2. Historical Perspectives

Separation of Power

Birth of the Council of State (Conseil d"Etat)

From Justice Retenue to Justice Deleguee

2.2.3. Administrative litigation

Expansion of concept of litigation: Birth of Objective Litigation

Recourse for Excess of Power

The Principle of Legality

Categorization of Litigation

- 2.2.4. Recent trends in administrative litigation in France
- 2.2.5. Conclusion
- 2.3. German: Control type litigation
  - 2.3.1. Introduction
  - 2.3.2. History

Emergence of administrative law (19 Century Prussia)

Development of Administrative Law (19th century Prussia)

Gradual Paradigm Shift (Weimar Constitution during the 20<sup>th</sup> century): From Control Type to Remedy Type

Radical Paradigm Shift (Bonn Constitution during the 20<sup>th</sup> century) From Control Type to Remedy Type 2.3.3. Institution

Separation of Powers

**Establishment of Administrative Court** 

Type of Litigation: Control

**Enumeration Clause** 

Introduction of Limited General Clause (Police Order)

2.3.4. Theory

From Political Scientific Method to Legal Method

Denial Theory on Subjective Right

Affirmative Theory of Subjective Right

2.3.5. Conclusion

Historical standpoint

Institutional standpoint

Theoretical standpoint

- 2.4. Japan: From Administrative State to Judicial State
  - 2.4.1. Introduction
  - 2.4.2. Institution on administrative court and procedure under Meiji constitution
  - 2.4.3. Theory on administrative court and procedure under Meiji Constitution

Conservative scholars' theory

Liberal scholars' theory

Conclusion

2.4.4. Administrative litigation under the contemporary Constitution

From control type to remedy type administrative litigation

Law for Special Regulations concerning the Procedure of Administrative Litigation

The ACLA

Relation of the Law for Special Regulations concerning the Procedure of Administrative Litigation to the ACLA

**Judicial State Theory** 

Japanese administrative law status of 1950s before adopting the ACLA

- 2.4.5. Conclusion
- 2.5. Conclusion

# Chapter III: Overview of Mongolian Administrative Litigation since 2002

- 3.1. Introduction
- 3.2. Administrative Court Structure in Mongolia
  - 3.2.1. Background issue of the establishment of administrative court

Selection of a legal system which suits Mongolia and its impact on establishment of administrative court Legal assistance from Germany in creation of administrative court

- 3.2.2. Structure of administrative court
- 3.3. The Law on Procedure for Administrative Case (LPAC) 2002
  - 3.3.1. Drafting process of the LPAC
  - 3.3.2. Relationship between the Law on Civil Procedure and the Law on Procedure for Administrative Case (LPAC)

Overlapping jurisdiction

Extensive quotations from civil procedure

End note of 3.3.2.

- 3.3.3. Defendant as administrative agency
- 3.3.4. Jurisdiction as Enumeration Principle
- 3.3.5. Preliminary Proceedings as Administrative complaint
- 3.4. Conclusion

#### **Chapter IV: Conditions of Administrative Litigation**

- 4.1. Introduction
- 4.2. Administrative Disposition/Act
  - 4.2.1. Institution

Japanese Institution on the Administrative Disposition

The elements of administrative disposition

Mongolian Institutions on the Administrative Act

Elements of administrative act

#### 4.2.2. Practice

Japanese Practice on the Administrative Disposition

The Rubbish Incinerator Case

Chains of Action Case (Blueprint Case)

The Project Plan Case

Revocation of Administrative Recommendation Case

Mongolian Practice on the Administrative Act

Registration of Immoveable Property Case

The Gatsuurt Village Heating Plant Case

Tax Office Case

The National Human Rights Commission (NHRC) case

#### 4.2.3. Conclusion on Administrative Act

Japan

Mongolia

#### 4.3. Standing

# 4.3.1. Institution

Japan

Standing for action for judicial review

Active Usage of Public Law-Related action

**Public Law-Related Action** 

Interest of Litigation as requirement for Public Law-Related Action

#### Mongolia

Standing provided by the general law

Standing provided by Individual Law

Conclusion

Japan

Mongolia

# 4.3.2. Practice

Japanese Practice on Standing

The Odakyu Line case

Mongolian Practice on Standing

**Bayan Mongol Apartment Case** 

Land License for Korean Citizen Case

Borderless Rivers NGO Case

"Owners of the Khuvsgul Lake" NGO Case

# 4.3.3. Conclusion on Standing

Japan

Mongolia

#### 4.4. Objective Interest of Litigation

- 4.4.1. Japan
- 4.4.2. Mongolia
- 4.4.3. Conclusion
- 4.5. Conclusion

# Chapter V: Recent Developments in Administrative Law: From Administrative Control Toward Remedy of Subjective Right?

- 5.1. Introduction
- 5.2. Background
- 5.3. The General Administrative Law (GAL)
  - 5.3.1. Drafting and Enactment of the GAL
  - 5.3.2. Expectation of the GAL in the area of administrative law

5.3.3. New and Progressive institutions of the GAL: moving in the direction of a remedy based individual rights approach.

Scope of applicability of law

Definition of administrative act and agency

Administrative Contract and Normative Administrative Act

Damage claim

Procedural principles and requirements

5.3.4. Problem and Limits of the GAL

Purpose of regulation and Relation with other laws

Semi-definition based approach

- 5.4. The Administrative Court Procedure Law (ACPL)
  - 5.4.1. Essential features in relation to paradigm change

Purpose of the Litigation

Introduction of General Clause

Types of Action

5.4.2. Control and Remedy type litigation

Overview

Paradigm Change Complete Yet?

- 5.5. Summary of Administrative Litigation Status to date
- 5.6. Conclusion

#### Conclusion

**Bibliography** 

#### **Abstract**

In the area of administrative law, it is essential to determine the role of the judiciary as a protector of rights and interests granted by the Constitution, while at the same time not hindering the genuine tasks of the executive arm of the government to function in the public law sphere. To be specific, this research examined, within the Mongolian context, the question of why it is important to differentiate between the judiciary as a tool of control of the executive branch of government and as an instrument for the protection of rights and interests in relation to the citizens and the state. The concept of judicial review in relation to the initial conditions required for litigation in administrative law is a new and unchallenged area of law and practice in Mongolia in terms of theoretical roots and background.

From a structural point of view, this thesis examines the paradigm change of administrative litigation in Mongolia from historical, comparative, and typological perspectives in each of its five chapters. Thus, a comparative typological analysis is made in three consecutive phases (from control, to remedy, up to the end of paradigm change). First, chapters one and two examine Mongolian administrative litigation from its initial status, as a Control Type administrative dispute settlement system, moving toward a Remedy Type system, which includes a historical and comparative study of French, German and Japanese models of administrative litigation. In next phase, chapters three and four scrutinized in detail based on the findings of previous chapters (first attempt of reform) to determine paradigm change in Mongolian administrative litigation, comparatively with Japanese institution and practice. Chapter five includes additional analysis of recent administrative law developments, which constitutes the (second attempt) to reform Mongolian administrative law. The final section of chapter five asks if the paradigm in Mongolian administrative litigation is complete from a typological perspective, transforming from Administrative Control to Court Remedy.

Concerning the argument presented in the thesis, there has been no prior research conducted that responds to the question of the status of Mongolian administrative litigation in terms of a comparative typology analysis: control type or remedy type, as well as a historical perspective in relation to the present paradigm and its tendency. Until there is an understanding of how and under what circumstances and influence Mongolian administrative litigation began and eventually formed its present status, it would be impossible to determine the

exact cause of setbacks in development and suggest further improvement for administrative litigation in Mongolia. Therefore, the intended aim of the current research, which is consistent with such an understanding, is to advance the development of administrative litigation, specifically contributing to paradigm change that facilitates greater protection of individual rights and legal interests through judicial review.

In relation to the first part of the research question for this thesis, particularly concerning the phrase "From Administrative Control," it must be noted, from the viewpoint of administrative litigation and history, that soviet administrative dispute settlement is one variety of control type (administrative control). Therefore, in Mongolia the control type administrative settlement procedure was established. In other words, providing a remedy based on individual rights was not the purpose of administrative litigation in Mongolia, from the 1920s up to the 1990s. This was a non-contentious (non-litigation) type procedure; in other words, it was not an adversarial system. With regards to the second part of the research question, from Administrative Control "to Court Remedy," even though the law changed to an adversarial (litigation) type of procedure, in actual practice the control type of procedure is often utilized which reveals that the paradigm change is formal but not substantial. Paradigm change from control type to remedy type has been somewhat achieved at the institutional level in the sphere of administrative litigation; however, legal thinking and practice in Mongolia is difficult to change, as it endeavors to transition toward a remedy type litigation, because of path dependence.

Finally, is the paradigm change complete? By the enactment of the General Administrative Law and the Administrative Court Procedure Law, Mongolian administrative law recognizes the categorization of litigation; thus, it now distinguishes between the different purposes of different types of litigation. Based on this step, it will serve as a catalyst to further strengthen subjective litigation by developing preconditions such as the concept of administrative act and standing. The administrative law reforms in 2016 are another attempt to change to remedy type administrative litigation as a continuum of the first attempt that took place in the early 2000s. The Mongolian approach to legal interpretation includes first defining the legal concept in statutory law and then enforcing this concept through case law. In this circumstance, because of insufficient practice and poor theoretical basis, it is difficult to appropriately use abstract legal concepts in particular cases. With regards to some of the findings of the current research in the recent Mongolian administrative litigation law, the ACPL is one example of a practical application of the thesis claim. Such reforms represent a preferred way in which to

develop the law, where accumulation of practice and theoretical discussions related to the cases help to shape the further development of statutory law regulations.

### **Bibliography**

- Algaa, Tuvshintulga, and Batbayar Bayanbaatar. *Монгол Улсын хууль зүйн шинжлэх ухааны ном зүйн бүртгэл. Гарын авлага /1911-2012/* [Book-List of Legal Scientific Literatures in Mongolia (1911-2012)]. Ulaanbaatar, 2014.
- Barry, Donald D. "Administrative Justice: The Role of Soviet Courts in Controlling Administrative Acts." In *Soviet Administrative Law: Theory and Policy*, edited by George Ginsburgs, Gianmaria Ajani, Gerard Pieter Berg, and William B. Simons, 63–84. BRILL, 1989.
- Beatty, David M. Human Rights and Judicial Review: A Comparative Perspective. Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 1994
- Beermann, René. "A Historical Approach to the Definition of Soviet Administrative Law." In *Soviet Administrative Law: Theory and Policy*, edited by George Ginsburgs, Gianmaria Ajani, Gerard Pieter Berg, and William B. Simons, 9–24. BRILL, 1989.
- Berman, Harold J. "The Dilemma of Soviet Law Reform." Harvard Law Review 76, no. 5 (March 1963): 929.
- Bermann, George. *Codification of Administrative Procedure*. Edited by Jean-Bernard Auby. Editions juridiques Bruylant, 2013.
- Biraa, Chimid. "Шүүх эрх мэдлийн талаархи Үндсэн хуулийн үзэл баримтлалын тухайд" [Concept of Constitution on Judicial Power]. 42–60. Ulaanbaatar, 2001.
- . Terguun Devter. Edited by Unentugs Shagdar. Vol. 1 of Concept of the Constitution. Ulaanbaatar, 2002. . Terguun Devter. Edited by Unentugs Shagdar. Vol. 1 of Үндсэн хуулийн үзэл баримтлал [Concept of the Constitution]. Ulaanbaatar, 2002.
- "Монгол Улсын захиргааны хэргийн шүүхийн мөн чанар, нийгэм эрх зүйн ач холбогдол" [Fundamental Understandings and Values of the Administrative Court]. In Захиргааны хэргийн шүүх: Монгол дахь шинэтгэл, дэлхийн улсуудын жишиг, 2004.
- ——., ed. Захиргааны хэргийн шүүхийн тухай мэдэгдэхүүн [Knowledge on Administrative Court]. The National Legal Center, 2004.
- ——. *БНМАУ-ын захиргааны эрх* [MPR Administrative Law]. Edited by Avirmed Erentsen. Ulaanbaatar, 1973.
- ———. "The Development of the System of MPR Agencies of State Administration (1921-1924)." In *The Mongolian Legal System: Contemporary Legislation and Documentation*, edited by William Elliott Butler, 251–58. BRILL, 1982.
- "Захиргааны хэргийн шүүхийг нураасны хариуцлагыг хэн хүлээх вэ?" [Who is Responsible for Dismantling Administrative Court?]. Ulaanbaatar, 2006.
- Borchard, Edwin. *French Administrative Law* Working Paper. Faculty Scholarship Series, 1933. http://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=4446&context=fss\_papers.
- Bornhak, Conrad. "Rudolf von Gneist." *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 7 (1896): 253–69.
- Brach, Gilbert E. "What Are You Doing Where Do You Stand Editorial." *Marquette Law Review* 4 (1919–1920): 57.
- Brown, L. Neville (Lionel Neville), Nicole Questiaux, and J. F. (John Francis) Garner. French Administrative Law / by L. Neville Brown and J. F. Garner, with the Assistance of Nicole Questiaux. London: Butterworths, 1973.
- Brown, Lionel Neville, John Bell, and Jean-Michel Galabert. French Administrative Law. Clarendon Press, 1998.
- Butler, William Elliott, ed. "Russian, Soviet, and Mongolian Law on Microfiche 4th Cumulative Catalogue." Brill, 1988. http://www.brill.com/sites/default/files/ftp/downloads/32023\_Titlelist.pdf.
- ———. The Mongolian Legal System: Contemporary Legislation and Documentation. BRILL, 1982.
- Chimidlkham, Ganbat. "Judicial Reform in Mongolia." Australia, n.d.
- Chunt, Boldbaatar, ed. 1940 оны Үндсэн хууль: Түүх, эрх зүйн асуудал [The 1940 Constitution: History and Legislation]. Ulaanbaatar, 2016.
- Damba, Danzandorj. "On Rules for Deciding Citizens' Proposals, Applications, and Appeals." In *The Mongolian*

- *Legal System: Contemporary Legislation and Documentation*, edited by William Elliott Butler, 153–57. BRILL, 1982.
- Darjaa, Zundui, and Chinbat Namjil. *БНМАУ-ын иргэний байцаан шийтгэх хуулийн тайлбар* [Commentary on the MPR Civil Investigative Procedure Law]. Ulaanbaatar, 1984.
- Dashbalbar, Gangabaatar. *Үндсэн хуулийн эрх зүй Төрийн байгуулал, зарчим, үзэл баримтлал* [Constitutional Law: State Structure, Principles and Policies]. Ulaanbaatar, 2016.
- Dashdondog, Dashtseden. *Монгол Улсын захиргааны эрх зүй I* [Administrative Law in Mongolia I]. 1. Ulaanbaatar, 2002.
- Dashdondov, Sangidanzan. "Courts of the Mongolian People's Republic (Historical Notes)." In *The Mongolian Legal System: Contemporary Legislation and Documentation*, edited by William Elliott Butler. BRILL, 1982.
- Deak, Francis, and Max Rheinstein. "The Machinery of Law Administration in France and Germany." *University of Pennsylvania Law Review and American Law Register* 84, no. 7 (May 1936): 846.
- Dean, Meryll. Japanese Legal System. Cavendish Publishing, 2002.
- Dobb, Maurice Herbert. Russian Economic Development since the Revolution. New York: Dutton and Co, 1928.
- Dondov, Ganzorig. *Захиргааны эрх зүйн тайлбар толь* [Administrative Law Dictionary]. Ulaanbaatar, 2002. ———. "Монгол Улсын захиргааны эрх зүйд тулгарч буй асуудал: Түүхэн хөгжил ба Цаашдын хандлага"
- ——. "Монгол Улсын захиргааны эрх зүйд тулгарч буй асуудал: Түүхэн хөгжил ба Цаашдын хандлага" [Challenges Faced with Administrative Law of Mongolia: Historical Development and Further Trend], 2011.
- "Захиргааны хууль бус шийдвэрийн улмаас хохирсон хохирогчийн эрхийн хэрэгжилтийн төлөв байдал" [Enforcement Status of the Revocery of Infringed Rights Caused by Illegal Administrative Decisions]. *The Human Right* 4 (2007): 71–108.
- "Захиргааны хэргийн шүүхэд нэхэмжлэл гаргах эрх" [Right to File an Action at Administrative Court]. *Human Right* 4 (2005). http://www.mn-nhrc.org/index.php?do=cat&category=33.
- Dugar, Sunjid. Захиргааны ерөнхий хууль: үзэл баримтлал, хэрэглээ [The General Administrative Law: Concept and Application]. Ulaanbaatar, 2017.
- ——. Der Gleichheitsgrundsatz in Bezug auf das allgemeine Gleichbehandlungsgesetz im deutschen und mongolischen Recht [The Principle of Proportionality with Regard to the General Equal Treatment Act of Germany and Mongolian Law]. Herbert Utz Verlag, 2009.
- Duguit, Leon. "The French Administrative Courts." *Political Science Quarterly* 29, no. 3 (1914): 385–407.
- Dziubla, Robert W. "The Impotent Sword of Japanese Justice: The Doctrine of Shobunsei as a Barrier to Administrative Litigation." *Cornell Int'l LJ* 18 (1985): 37.
- Enkhbaatar, Chimid, Peljid Amarjargal, Migeddorj Batchimeg, Tsegmid Davaadulam, Odonkhuu Munkhsiakhan, and Damdinsuren Solongo. Assessment of the Performance of the 1992 Constitution of Mongolia Assessment. Ulaanbaatar, 2016. http://www.mn.undp.org/content/dam/mongolia/Publications/DemGov/Undsen%20huuliin%20sudalg aa\_eng.pdf?download.
- Erdenetsogt Adilbish. "Захиргааны хэргийн шүүхэд нэхэмжлэх эрх нээгдэх нөхцөл" [Condition for Right to File an Action at Administrative Court]. *State and Law of Mongolia* 2 (2003).
- ——. "Formation and Challenges Facing Administrative Procedure Law in Mongolia." Мэргэжил F380102, National University of Mongolia, 2009. http://stf.mn/infodb/detail?id=8617.
- "Захиргааны хэрэг хянан шийдвэрлэх ажиллагааг боловсронгуй болгох асуудал" [The Improvement of the Administrative Adjudication]. *National University of Mongolia, School of Law, Law Review* 2. 34 (2016).
- Erentsen, Avirmed, and Chimid Biraa. "The Nature of Socialist Law." In *The Mongolian Legal System:* Contemporary Legislation and Documentation, edited by William Elliott Butler, 36–39. BRILL, 1982.
- Evans, Roger Warren. "French and German Administrative Law: With Some English Comparisons." International and Comparative Law Quarterly 14, no. 4 (1965): 1104–23.
- Feld, Werner. "German Administrative Courts." Tul. L. Rev. 36 (1961): 495.
- Fenton, Howard N. "An Essay on Administrative Law Reform in the Former Soviet Union." Journal of East

- European Law 7, no. 1 (2000): 47–82.
- Galsan, Sovd. *Монгол Улсын Үндсэн хууль Хүний эрх /харьцуулсан судалгаа/* [The Constitution of Mongolia, Human Rights /Comparative Law/]. Ulaanbaatar, 1999.
- Galsan, Sovd, V. Riabtsev, and S.Tserendorj. "Perfecting the Organization and Legal Basis of Procuracy Agencies is a Vital Force Strengthening Legality." In *The Mongolian Legal System: Contemporary Legislation and Documentation*, edited by William Elliott Butler, 135–38. BRILL, 1982.
- Garner, James W. "French Administrative Law." Yale Law Journal 33 (1924): 597.
- ——. "Judicial Control of Administrative and Legislative Acts in France." *American Political Science Review* 9, no. 04 (November 1915): 637–65.
- Gellhorn, Walter. Ombudsmen and Others: Citizens' Protectors in Nine Countries. Harvard University Press, 1967.
- ------. "Review of Administrative Acts in the Soviet Union." *Columbia Law Review* 66, no. 6 (June 1966): 1051.
- Gepperth, Rainer, National Security Council (U.S.), Mongolia Khuul' Zuĭn İAam, and Hanns-Seidel-Stiftung. Human Rights and National Security: Documentation of an International Symposium Held Under the Auspices of the National Security Council and the Ministry of Justice of Mongolia and of the Hanns Seidel Foundation of the Federal Republic of Germany at Ulaanbaatar 30 September-4 October 1996. Hanns Seidel Foundation, 1998.
- Ginsburg, Tom. Judicial Review in New Democracies: Constitutional Courts in Asian Cases. Cambridge University Press, 2003.
- Gochoo, Banzragch. "Constitutional and statutory law basis of the German Administrative Court (II part)." *The National Legal Institute of Mongolia Law Review* 2, no. (29) (2010): 59–64.
- "Монгол улсын захиргааны хэрэг шүүхэд хянан шийдвэрлэх тухай хуулийн шинэчилсэн найруулгын тухайд" [On Revised Administrative Court Procedure Law of Mongolia]. *The Judicial Power* 1 (2016).
- ——. "Overview of Development of Administrative Court in Germany." *The National Legal Institute of Mongolia Law Review* 3 (2008): 58–65.
- ——. "Rechtsstaat ба Захиргааны хэргийн шүүх" [Rechtsstaat and Administrative Court]. *The Judicial Power* 2 (2014): 31–35.
- ——. "Verwaltungsprozessrecht in Deutschland und der Mongolei Ein RechtsvergleichGerman and Mongolian Administrative Procedure Law: Comparative Legal Study." Bayreuth, 2008.
- Goodman, Carl F. *The Rule of Law in Japan: A Comparative Analysis, Third Edition Revised.* Third Revised edition. Alphen aan den Rijn, The Netherlands: Kluwer Law International, 2012.
- Goodnow, F. J., and E. Laferriere. "Traite de La Juridiction Administrative et Des Recours Contentieux." *Political Science Quarterly* 11, no. 2 (June 1896): 352.
- Goodnow, Frank J., and E. Laferriere. "Traite de La Juridiction Administrative et Des Recours Contentieux." *Political Science Quarterly* 2, no. 4 (December 1887): 709.
- Goodnow, Frank Johnson. Comparative Administrative Law: An Analysis of the Administrative Systems, National and Local, of the United States, England, France, and Germany. The Lawbook Exchange, Ltd., 2005.
- Haley, John Owen. "Toward a Reappraisal of Occupation Legal Reforms: Administrative Accountability." In Eibeihô Ronshû (Essays on Anglo-American Law) (Hideo Tanaka Festschrift), 543–67, 1996.
- Hanns-Seidel Stiftung, ed. *Монгол Улсын захиргааны хэрэг хянан шийдвэрлэх ажиллагаа* [Administrative Court Procedure in Mongolia], 2004.
- Harbich, Jürgen. "Өрнө, дорнын эрх зүйн харилцан уялдаа- Монгол Улсын нийтийн эрх зүйн жишээн дээр" [Inter-Consistency of Western and Eastern Law: Public Law in Mongolia as an Example]. Ulaanbaatar, 2014.5.30. http://www.legalinfo.mn/details/282.
- Hathaway, Oona A. "Path Dependence in the Law: The Course and Pattern of Legal Change in a Common Law System" (2000). https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\_id=239332.
- Henning, Pieter. "Thoughts on Administrative Law." Comparative and International Law Journal of Southern Africa 2 (1969): 86–99.
- Hitomi, Takeshi. "Revision of the Administrative Appeal Act." Waseda Bulletin of Comparative Law 34 (October 22, 2014): 177–79.

- Institute of International Studies of the Academy of Science. *Герман: Судалгаа, мэдээлэл* [Germany: Study, Information]. 1(3), 2004.
- James, Herman Gerlach. Principles of Prussian Administration. Macmillan Company, 1913.
- Jamsran, Dolgorsuren. *Монгол Улсын захиргааны эрх зүй* [Administrative Law in Mongolia]. Ulaanbaatar, 2000.
- ——. Монгол Улсын захиргааны эрх зүйн удиртгал [Introductory to Administrative Law of Mongolia]. Ulaanbaatar, 2006.
- Jamyankhorloo, Sukhbaatar. Монгол Улсын захиргааны эрх зүй [Administrative Law]. Ulaanbaatar, 2002.
- Jean-Marc Sauvé. "The Council of State and the Protection of Fundamental Rights." Nagoya University, October 27, 2016.
- Jugnee, Amarsanaa. Constitutionalism and Constitutional Review in Mongolia, 2009.
- ., ed. *Монгол Улсын шүүх эрх мэдлийн шинэтгэл (Сүүлийн 20 жилийн тойм)* [The Judicial Reform of Mongolia (Overview for Last 20 Years)]. Ulaanbaatar, 2010. https://www.forum.mn/res mat/res mat-43.pdf.
- . Transitional Period and Legal Reform in Mongolia, 2009.
- Jugnee, Amarsanaa, and Batsaikhan Ookhnoi. *The Constitutions of Mongolia 1924-1940-1960-1992*. Translated by Tur-Od Lkhagvajav. Ulaanbaatar, 2009.
- Kadomatsu, Narufumi. "Judicial Governance through Resolution of Legal Disputes A Japanese Perspective." National Taiwan University Law Review 4 (2009): 141–62.
- Khukhiisuren, Batsuren, Soyol-Erdene Purevdorj, and Tungalag Chuluun. "Overview of administrative law development in Mongolia (1911-2015), in" [Kh.Batsuren, P.Soyol-Erdene and Ch.Tungalag, Overview of Administrative Law Development in Mongolia (1911-2015)]. In Монголын Шүүх II Түүхэн хөгжлийн тойм, өгүүлэл нийтлэл, edited by The Supreme Court of Mongolia, 232–35. 2. Ulaanbaatar, 2016.
- Ködderitzsch, Lorenz. "Administrative Litigation and Administrative Procedure Law." In *History of Law in Japan since 1868*, edited by Wilhelm Röhl, 627–55. BRILL, 2005.
- Kunig, Philip. "Recommendation on further development on Administrative procedure and administrative litigation." Ulaanbaatar, 2003.
- Künnecke, Martina. *Tradition and Change in Administrative Law: An Anglo-German Comparison*. Berlin; New York: Springer, 2007.
- Latour, Bruno. The Making of Law: An Ethnography of the Conseil d'Etat. Wiley, 2014.
- Ledford, Kenneth F. "Formalizing the Rule of Law in Prussia: The Supreme Administrative Law Court, 1876–1914." *Central European History* 37, no. 02 (2004): 203–224.
- Lkhundev, Atartsetseg. "Selected issues on litigation of an action declaration of existence or non-existence of legal relationship." *The Judicial Power* 2 (2014): 27–30.
- Lobingier, C. Sumner. "Administrative Law and Droit Administratif." U. Pa. L. Rev. 91 (1942): 36.
- Maggs, Peter B. Substantive and Procedural Protection of the Rights of Economic Entities and Their Owners in the USSR. In search of the law-governed state. Washington, D.C., 1991. https://www.ucis.pitt.edu/nceeer/1991-805-01-Maggs.pdf.
- Mirkine-Guetzévitch, B. "The Public Law System of the Sovietic Dictatorship." *Journal of Comparative Legislation and International Law* 12, no. 4 (1930): 248–268.
- Mongolian Bar Association. "Шүүхийн хяналт ба Засгийн газар' нээлттэй хэлэлцүүлэг" [Judicial Review and Government Cabinet Discussion] Open. *https://www.mglbar.mn*. Ulaanbaatar, May 4, 2017, open. Ulaanbaatar. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dueK1f9vl-o.
- Namsrai, Tungalag. "Монгол Улсын захиргааны хэргийн шүүхийн онцлог" [Characteristics of Administrative Court of Mongolia]. Ulaanbaatar, 2004.
- Norov P, ed. *БНМАУ-ын төрийн захиргааны эрх Ерөнхий анги* [MPR State Administrative Law, General Part]. Ulaanbaatar, 1964.
- Oda, Hiroshi. "In Search of the Law-Governed State: The Law-Based State and the CPSU" (n.d.). https://www.ucis.pitt.edu/nceeer/1991-805-01-Oda.pdf.
- ———. "The Emergence of Pravovoegosudârstvo (Rechtsstâat in Russia)." Review of Central and East European Law 3 (1999): 373–434.

- Odonkhuu, Munkhsaikhan. *Towards Better Protection of Fundamental Rights in Mongolia: Constitutional Review and Interpretation*, 2014. http://ir.nul.nagoya-u.ac.jp/jspui/bitstream/2237/20123/1/CALEBOOK%204.pdf.
- OECD. Better Regulation in Europe Better Regulation in Europe: France 2010. OECD Publishing, 2010.
- Orosoo, Zandraa. "Захиргааны шүүх иргэний үндсэн эрхийн хамгаалалт болж чадсан" [Administrative Court Became a Protection of Fundamental Rights of Citizen]. Ulaanbaatar, 2014.05.28. Ulaanbaatar. http://www.supremecourt.mn/news/75.
- . "Монгол Улсад захиргааны хэргийн дагнасан шүүх байгуулагдсан нь" [Establishment of Specialized Administrative Court in Mongolia]. In *Монголын Шүүх II Түүхэн хөгжлийн тойм, өгүүлэл нийтлэл*, edited by The Supreme Court of Mongolia. 2. Ulaanbaatar, 2016.
- Osborn, Robert J. "Citizen versus Administration in the USSR\*." *Europe-Asia Studies* 17, no. 2 (1965): 226–237.
- Pakuscher, Ernst K. "Administrative Law in Germany-Citizen v. State." *The American Journal of Comparative Law* 16, no. 3 (1968): 309–31.
- Purevdolgor, Odgerel. Захиргааны эрх зүй Ерөнхий анги [General Part on Administrative Law]. 1st ed. Ulaanbaatar, 2004.
- ——. "Захиргааны актын тухай ойлголтын шинэлэг тал" [New Aspects of the Concept of Administrative Act]. *State and Law of Mongolia* 2 (2004).
- Quigley, John. "The New Soviet Law on Appeals: Glasnost in the Soviet Courts." *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* 37, no. 01 (1988): 172–177.
- Röhl, Wilhelm. History of Law in Japan since 1868. BRILL, 2005.
- Ruffert, Matthias, ed. *The Model Rules on EU Administrative Procedures: Adjudication*. European administrative law series 11. Groningen: Europa Law Publishing, 2016.
- Sanders, Alan J. K. "Mongolia's New Constitution: Blueprint for Democracy." *Asian Survey* 32, no. 6 (June 1992): 506–20.
- Schneider, Jens-Peter. "German Traditions in Administrative Law: Obstacles to a Common Legal Framework?" In *Administrative Law in Europe: Between Common Principles and National Traditions*, edited by Matthias Ruffert. European administrative law series 7. Europa Law Publishing, 2013.
- Schwartz, Bernard. French Administrative Law and the Common-Law World. The Lawbook Exchange, Ltd., 1954
- Seerden, Rene J. G. H., ed. *Administrative Law of the European Union, Its Member States and the United States: A Comparative Analysis.* 3 edition. Cambridge, United Kingdom; Portland: Maastricht, The Netherlands: Intersentia, 2012.
- Sharlet, Robert. "In Search of the Law-Governed State: The Fate of Individual Rights in the Age of Perestroika." *Political Affairs* (1988): 19.
- Singh, Mahendra P. German Administrative Law in Common Law Perspective. Springer Science & Business Media, 2001.
- Sodovsuren, Narangerel. "Historical Outline of Development of Mongolian Law." The National Taiwan University, 2003. http://www.mtac.gov.tw/mtacbook/upload/09301/0702/5.pdf.
- Solomon, Peter H. "Judicial Power in Russia: Through the Prism of Administrative Justice." *Law & Society Review* 38, no. 3 (2004): 549–582.
- Stolleis, Michael. A History of Public Law in Germany, 1914-1945. Oxford University Press, 2004.
- ———. Public Law in Germany, 1800-1914. Berghahn Books, 2001.
- Stroink, F. A. M. Judicial Lawmaking and Administrative Law. Intersentia nv, 2005.
- Sugai Shuichi, and Sonobe Itsuo. Administrative law in Japan. Tōkyō: Gyōsei, 1999.
- Takayanagi, Shinichi. "Gyōseikokka-sei kara shihō kokka-sei e" [From Administrative State System to Judicial State System]. In *Kōhō No Riron: Tanaka Jiro Sensei Koki Kinen*. Vol. 3–2. Tokyo: Yuhikaku, 1977.
- Tegshjargal, Sengedorj. *МУИС-ын Хууль зүйн сургууль: Түүхэн хөгжил ба Шинэ зуун* [School of Law, National University of Mongolia: Historical Development and New Era]. Ulaanbaatar, 2014.
- The Hanns Seidel Foundation. "Монгол Улсын эрх зүйн шинэтгэл: Шилжилтийн үе" [Legal Reform in Mongolia: Transition Period. Documentation of an International Symposium], 2006.
- The Supreme Court of Mongolia. Монголын Шүүх II Түүхэн хөгжлийн тойм, өгүүлэл нийтлэл [Judiciary in

- Mongolia II Articles on Historical Development Overview]. 2. Ulaanbaatar, 2016.
- Tsend, Tsogt. "Захиргааны процессын эрх зүйн шинэчлэл: захиргааны хэрэг хянан шийдвэрлэх ажиллагааны төрөл" [Administrative Procedure Law Reform: Purpose and Categorization of Administrative Litigation]. *National University of Mongolia, School of Law, Law Review* 2. 34 (2016). http://legaldata.mn/b/119.
- . "Монгол Улсын захиргааны хэргийн шүүхийн эрх зүйн орчин, дүн шинжилгээ" [Legal Environment and Analysis of Administrative Court in Mongolia]. *The National Legal Institute of Mongolia Law Review* 2016/03 (58) (2016).
- ——. "Normative Administrative Act." In *Монгол Улсын Захиргааны ерөнхий хууль (Сургалтын гарын авлага)*. Ulaanbaatar: Hanns Seidel Foundation, 2016. http://legaldata.mn/b/127.
- ——. "Захиргааны хэргийн шүүх Хүний эрх" [The Administrative Court Human Right]. *The Human Right* 4 (2005).
- ——. "The Availability and Scope of Judicial Review of Administrative Action (Comparative Study Mongolia and US)." LL.M, Willamette University College of Law, 2007. http://legaldata.mn/b/245.
- Uhlman, Rudolf E., and Hans G. Rupp. "German System of Administrative Courts: A Contribution to the Discussion of the Proposed Federal Administrative Court." *Illinois Law Review* 31 (1936–1937): 1028–46.
- ------. "German System of Administrative Courts: A Contribution to the Discussion of the Proposed Federal Administrative Court." *Ill. L. Rev.* 31 (1936): 847.
- Vaksberg, Arkady. Stalin's Prosecutor: The Life of Andrei Vyshinsky. Translated by Jan Butler. New York: Grove Pr, 1991.
- Vanchig, Udval. "Шүүх эрх мэдэл" [Power to Adjudicate]. In *The issues of the concept of the Constitution of Mongolia*, 122–35, 1999.
- ——. Удирдлагын эрх зүй [Regulatory Law]. Ulaanbaatar, 1999.
- Wada, Hideo. "The Administrative Court under the Meiji Constitution." Law Japan 10 (1977): 1.
- Weil, Prosper. "The Strength and Weakness of French Administrative Law." *The Cambridge Law Journal* 23, no. 02 (November 1965): 242.
- Woolf, The Right Hon Lord. *De Smith's Judicial Review: Mainwork & Supplement*. Edited by Sir Jeffrey Jowell and Prof Andrew le Sueur. 7th Revised edition edition. London: Sweet & Maxwell, 2014.
- Зеленцов, А. Б. "Кодекс административного судопроизводства Российской Федерации как предпосылка смены парадигмы в теории административного права" [Code of Administrative Court Procedure of the Russian Federation as a Prerequisite for Changing the Paradigm in the Theory of Administrative Law]. Административное право и проиесс 11 (2015): 22–37.
- "Түүчээ тэрэг" XXK ба Ашигт малтмалын газрын Кадастрын хэлтэс [Tuuchee tereg Company v. Mineral Authority] Case no 0380 (Mongolia|MN Захиргааны хэргийн анхан шатны 20 дугаар шүүх).
- "Сүүн бүтээгдэхүүн хэрэглэгчийн төв" ТББ ба Мэргэжлийн хяналтын ерөнхий газар ["Center for Dairy Product Consumers" NGO v. State Inspection Agency] Case no 0134 (Mongolia|MN Захиргааны хэргийн давж заалдах шатны шүүх).
- Иргэн Б ба Монгол Улсын хүний эрхийн үндэсний комиссын гишүүн П.Оюунчимэг, Мянганы сорилтын сангийн гүйцэтгэх захирлын үүрэг гүйцэтгэгч Б.Батбаатар нар [Mr.B v. Member of the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC)] Case no 040 (Mongolia|MN Улсын дээд шүүх).
- "Эм Си Си Си корпорэйшн" XXK ба Барилга, хот байгуулалтын яам болон Барилгын хөгжлийн төв Case no 448 (Mongolia|MN Захиргааны хэргийн давж заалдах шатны шүүх).
- Verwaltungsverfahrensgesetz [Administrative Procedure Act], 718 (Federal Law Gazette 1976).
- А.Цэрэнчимэдийн орон сууц хүссэн өргөдлийг шийдвэрлээгүй орхигдуулсан тухай нэхэмжлэлтэй хэрэг [Application for housing Case] Case no 619 (MN|Улаанбаатар Chingeltei District Court).
- Grundgesetz für die Bundesrepublik Deutschland [Basic Law for the Federal Republic of Germany], 2438 (Federal Law Gazette 1949).
- "Хил хязгааргүй гол мөрөн" ТББ -ын нэхэмжлэлтэй Иргэний харьяалал, шилжилт хөдөлгөөний ерөнхий газарт холбогдох хэрэг [Borderless Rivers NGO case] [2014] Case no 446 (Mongolia|MN Захиргааны хэргийн давж заалдах шатны шүүх, November 5, 2014).
- Case to seek revocation of an administrative disposition, 2005(Gyo-Hi)397, Minshu Vol. 62, No. 8 (Supreme Court of Japan, September 10, 2008).

- Chains of Action Case, Minshu Vol 20 No. 2, at 271 (Supreme Court of Japan).
- "Closing Document of International Symposium on 'Legal Reform and National Legal System." Ulaanbaatar, 2000.
- Verwaltungsgerichtsordnung (VwGO) [Code of Administrative Court Procedure], 686 (Federal Law Gazette 1991).
- Тэргүүн шадар сайд Н.Алтанхуягын нэхэмжлэлтэй Төрийн албаны зөвлөлд холбогдох хэрэг [Deputy Prime Minister v. The State Council for Civil Service] [2011] Case no 338 (Mongolia|MN Нийслэлийн захиргааны хэргийн шүүх, September 1, 2011).
- Дүүргийн татварын хэлтэс [District Tax Office v. Capital City Tax Dispute Commission] Case no 237 (Mongolia|MN Нийслэлийн захиргааны хэргийн шүүх).
- "Documents of International Symposium on 'Legal Reform and National Legal System." Ulaanbaatar, 2000.
- Шударга өрсөлдөөн, хэрэглэгчийн төлөө газрын нэхэмжлэлтэй НИТХ-ын тэргүүлэгчдэд холбогдох хэрэг [Fair Competition and Consumer Protection Agency v. Ulaanbaatar City Council] [2015] Case no 2390 (Mongolia|MN Захиргааны хэргийн анхан шатны 20 дугаар шүүх, April 8, 2015).
- Шударга өрсөлдөөн, хэрэглэгчийн төлөө газрын нэхэмжлэлтэй Нийслэлийн засаг даргад холбогдох хэрэг [Fair Competition and Consumer Protection Agency v. Ulaanbaatar City Mayor] [2015] Case no 2409 (Mongolia|MN Захиргааны хэргийн анхан шатны 20 дугаар шүүх, April 9, 2015).
- AAA [Administrative Appeal Act], 160 (1962).
- ACLA [Administrative Case Litigation Act], 139 (1962).
- APA [Administrative Procedure Act], 88 (1993).
- Жардзэв ХХК ба Улаанбаатар хотын Ерөнхий менежер ["Jardzev" company v. General Manager of Ulaanbaatar City] [2004] Case no 33 (Mongolia|MN Нийслэлийн захиргааны хэргийн шүүх, November 4, 2004).
- Захиргааны хэрэг хянан шийдвэрлэх тухай хуулийн зарим заалт үндсэн хуулийн холбогдох заалтуудыг зөрчсөн эсэх тухай маргааныг хянан шийдвэрлэсэн тухай Монгол Улсын Үндсэн хуулийн цэцийн дүгнэлт [Judgment on Petition for] (Mongolia|MN Constitutional Court).
- 3.Хайдарын нэхэмжлэлтэй, Нийслэлийн Иргэдийн Төлөөлөгчдийн Хурлын дарга, Тэргүүлэгчид холбогдох [Khaidar v. Ulaanbaatar City Council] [2016] Case no 573 (Mongolia|MN Нийслэлийн захиргааны хэргийн шүүх, August 16, 2016).
- Land License for Korean Citizen Case Capital city administrative court, 585 decree on May 10, 2010 (Нийслэлийн Захиргааны хэргийн шүүхийн шүүгчийн 2010 оны 5 дугаар сарын 10-ны өдрийн 585 дугаар захирамж) [2010] Case no 585 (Mongolia|MN Нийслэлийн захргааны хэргийн шүүх, May 10, 2010).
- Иргэдээс Төрийн Байгууллага, Албан Тушаалтанд Гаргасан Өргөдөл, Гомдлыг Шийдвэрлэх Тухай [Law on Procedure for Disposal of an Application, Complaint by a Citizen to the State Organization and Officials] (1995).
- 1990 Special Law on Complaint Procedure [Law on Procedure for Submitting the Complaint to the Court about Unlawful Activity of Organization and Official which Breached Right of Citizen of People's Republic of Mongolia] (1990 оны 3 дугаар сарын 23-ны өдөр).
- Монгол Улсын шүүх, прокурор, мөрдөн байцаах, хэрэг бүртгэх байгууллагын хууль зөрчсөн ажиллагааны улмаас иргэнд учирсан хохирлыг арилгах журмын тухай хууль [Law on Procedure of Removing the Damage to the Citizen that Caused by Unlawful Activity of Investigative, Prosecutorial and Judicial Organization of People's Republic of Mongolia] (1990 оны 3 дугаар сарын 23-ны өдөр).
- Монгол нохой Нийгэмлэгийн нэхэмжлэлтэй хэрэг ["Mongol Dog" Society Case] Case no 641 (MN|Улаанбаатар Chingeltei District Court).
- Хүүхдийн хөдөлмөрийн тэвчишгүй хэлбэрүүдийн эсрэг үндэсний сүлжээ Нийгэмд үйлчлэх төрийн бус байгууллага, Хүүхэд хамгааллын үндэсний сүлжээ Нийгэмд үйлчлэх төрийн бус байгууллагуудын нэхэмжлэлтэй, Монгол Улсын Засгийн газарт холбогдох захиргааны хэрэг [National Child Protection Network and National Network against Intolerable Child Labor Forms v. Government Cabinet] (Mongolia|MN Capital City Administrative Court).
- Nihonkokukenpō [The Constitution of Japan] (1946).
- О.Лхагвадоржийн нэхэмжлэлтэй Баянмонгол хороололын газрын зөвшөөрөлтэй холбоотой хэрэг [O.Lkhagvadorj v. Governor of Ulaanbaatar city, City Land Office, and City Council] (Mongolia|MN

Нийслэлийн захиргааны хэргийн шүүх).

Owners of the Khuvsgul Lake NGO case [2013] Case no 117 (Mongolia|MN Улсын дээд шүүх, June 24, 2013). Revocation of Administrative Recommendation Case, [2005 Gyohi 207] Minshu Vol. 59 No. 6, at 1661 (Supreme Court of Japan).

Rubbish Incinerator Case, Minshu Vol 18 No. 8, at 1809 (Supreme Court of Japan).

Saibansho-hō [Court Act], 59 (1947).

Захиргааны хариуцлагын тухай хууль [The Administrative Penalty Law].

"Захиргааны хэрэг хянан шийдвэрлэх тухай хуулийн Хувийн хэрэг, УИХ-ын тамгын газрын архив" [The Archive Case File of the Law on Procedure for Administrative Case], 2002. The Parliament Archive.

"Захиргааны Ерөнхий Хуулийн Хувийн Хэрэг, УИХ-Ын Тамгын Газрын Архив" [The Case File of the General Administrative Law], 2015. The Parliament Archive.

Монгол Улсын Үндсэн Хууль [The Constitution of Mongolia] (1992).

GAL [The General Administrative Law] (2015).

Монгол Улсын Эрх Зүйн Шинэтгэлийн Хөтөлбөрийг Хэрэгжүүлэх Арга Хэмжээний Төлөвлөгөө [The Implementation Plan of the Legal Reform Program].

The Law for Special Regulations concerning the Procedure of Administrative Litigations, Pub. L. No. 81, Extra 1 Official Gazette Extra (1) 9–10 (Govt. Print. Bureau 1948).

Иргэний Хэрэг Шүүхэд Хянан Шийдвэрлэх Тухай [The Law on Civil Procedure] (1994).

Захиргааны Хэргийн Шүүх Байгуулах Тухай Хууль [The Law on Establishment of Administrative Court] (2002).

Захиргааны Хэрэг Хянан Шийдвэрлэх Тухай [The Law on Procedure for Administrative Case] (2002).

Захиргааны Хэрэг Шүүхэд Хянан Шийдвэрлэх Тухай [The Law on Procedure for Administrative Case] (2016).

Монгол Улсын Эрх зүйн шинэтгэлийн хөтөлбөр [The Legal Reform Program].

БНМАУ-ын Иргэний байцаан шийтгэх тухай хууль [The MPR Civil Investigation Procedure Law] (1952).

БНМАУ-ын Иргэний байцаан шийтгэх тухай хууль [The MPR Civil Investigation Procedure Law] (1967).

Монгол Улсын Хууль Тогтоомжийг 2000 Он Хүртэл Боловсронгуй Болгох Үндсэн Чиглэл [The parliamentary agenda on impoving legislation until 2000].

Энхтайван найрамдлын ордон ба Улсын бүртгэлийн газар [The Peace and Friendship Organization of Mongolia, a non-governmental organization] Case no 122 (Mongolia|MN Захиргааны хэргийн давж заалдах шатны шүүх).

Иргэний Хэрэг Шүүхэд Хянан Шийдвэрлэх Тухай (2002).